

Learning Progression: Crafting a Rebuttal

	1 There is no rebuttal.	2 A rebuttal is attempted, but it's off-target.	3 The rebuttal is valid but generic.	4 The rebuttal is valid and specific.	5 The rebuttal is valid, specific, and insightful.
Looks Like	Ignores the counterclaim entirely and just reasserts the original claim.	Dismisses the counterclaim without explaining why.	Genuinely concedes and/or refutes, but formulaically, without engaging the specific substance.	Engages the exact substance of the given counterclaim with precise, detail-tied reasoning.	Blends concession and refutation in a way that deepens the original claim rather than just defending against the objection.
Sounds Like	"Cell phones are too distracting, so schools need to ban them during the day."	"That's not really a good enough reason to keep phones around."	"It's true that phones can help in an emergency. However, the distraction they cause during class outweighs that benefit."	"It's true that immediate communication can feel essential during a lockdown. But most schools already run drills using PA systems and staff protocols built for that exact scenario – and a flood of student texts during a real lockdown can actively endanger a hiding student."	"The emergency-access argument is real, and a ban does remove a tool some families rely on. But the deeper issue isn't access – it's that the ban also removes the low-stakes practice students need to build self-regulation. That's not an argument against the ban; it's an argument for pairing it with explicit instruction in the skill it's currently assuming students already have."

Building Evidence-Based Arguments

Teaching Guide

In Social Studies	"Prohibition failed because it was impossible to enforce."	"That drop in consumption doesn't really prove anything."	"It's true that consumption dropped. However, the rise of organized crime shows the law still failed."	"That 30% drop is real, and it matters. But it doesn't capture the shift toward more dangerous, unregulated liquor, which likely raised the harm per drink even as total volume fell."	"That lasting drop in consumption is real, and it's arguably Prohibition's most significant effect. But a policy that reshapes culture while catastrophically failing at the rule of law it was built on isn't a defense of Prohibition – it's a more troubling verdict on what achieving that shift actually cost."
About Literature	"The boys' collapse into violence shows that civilization is only a thin veneer."	"That doesn't really change what happens to the boys later."	"It's true that the boys try to keep order at first. However, they quickly turn to violence once that order breaks down."	"The conch and the signal fire are real evidence of an early pull toward order. But that order was never rooted in genuine belief – it was borrowed from the adult world, which is exactly why it collapses the moment Jack offers an alternative source of power."	"The boys' early democratic structures are real, and they complicate a simple 'humans are savage' reading. But Golding doesn't let that early order redeem the group – it borrows its entire form from the adult world, which is why it evaporates the moment Jack offers a version of power the boys find more compelling. The order was never truly theirs to keep."